# Procedure file

| Basic information                          |                |                     |
|--|----------------|---------------------|
| DEC - Discharge procedure                  | 2010/2189(DEC) | Procedure completed |
| 2009 disharge: Clean Sky Joint Undertaking |                |                     |
| Subject<br>8.70.03.07 Previous discharges  |                |                     |

| Key players         |                                    |   |   |
|---------------------|------------------------------------|---|---|
| European Parliament | Committee responsible              | Rapporteur                                    | Appointed   |
|                     | CONT Budgetary Control             |   | 23/03/2010  |
|                     |                                    | S&D STAVRAKAKIS Georgic                       | os estados esta |
|                     |                                    | Shadow rapporteur                             |   |
|                     |                                    | PPE MACOVEI Monica                            |   |
|                     |                                    | ALDE GERBRANDY<br>Gerben-Jan                  |   |
|                     |                                    | Verts/ALE STAES Bart                          |   |
|                     |                                    |   |   |
|                     | Committee for opinion              | Rapporteur for opinion                        | Appointed   |
|                     | ITRE Industry, Research and Energy | The committee decided not to give an opinion. |   |
|                     |                                    |   |   |
|                     |                                    |   |   |
| European Commission | Commission DG                      | Commissioner                                  |   |
|                     | Budget                             | ŠEMETA Algirdas                               |   |

| events     |  |                     |         |
|------------|--|---------------------|---------|
| 20/07/2010 | Non-legislative basic document published   | SEC(2010)0963       | Summary |
| 07/10/2010 | Committee referral announced in Parliament |                     |         |
| 21/03/2011 | Vote in committee                          |                     | Summary |
| 06/04/2011 | Committee report tabled for plenary        | A7-0128/2011        |         |
| 10/05/2011 | Results of vote in Parliament              |                     |         |
| 10/05/2011 | Debate in Parliament                       | -                   |         |
| 10/05/2011 | Decision by Parliament                     | <u>T7-0185/2011</u> | Summary |
| 10/05/2011 | End of procedure in Parliament             |                     |         |
| 27/09/2011 | Final act published in Official Journal    |                     |         |

| Technical information      |                           |
|----------------------------|---------------------------|
| Procedure reference        | 2010/2189(DEC)            |
| Procedure type             | DEC - Discharge procedure |
| Other legal basis          | Rules of Procedure EP 159 |
| Stage reached in procedure | Procedure completed       |
| Committee dossier          | CONT/7/04079              |

| Documentation gateway                               |  |            |      |         |  |  |
|---|--|------------|------|---------|--|--|
| Non-legislative basic document                      | SEC(2010)0963                                | 20/07/2010 | EC   | Summary |  |  |
| Court of Auditors: opinion, report                  | N7-0003/2011<br>OJ C 342 16.12.2010, p. 0007 | 20/10/2010 | CofA | Summary |  |  |
| Committee draft report                              | PE450.712                                    | 31/01/2011 | EP   |         |  |  |
| Document attached to the procedure                  | 05894/2011                                   | 03/02/2011 | CSL  | Summary |  |  |
| Committee report tabled for plenary, single reading | <u>A7-0128/2011</u>                          | 06/04/2011 | EP   |         |  |  |
| Text adopted by Parliament, single reading          | <u>T7-0185/2011</u>                          | 10/05/2011 | EP   | Summary |  |  |

#### Final act

<u>Decision 2011/612</u> OJ L 250 27.09.2011, p. 0246 Summary

## 2009 disharge: Clean Sky Joint Undertaking

PURPOSE: presentation by the Commission of the consolidated annual accounts of the European Union for the financial year 2009, as part of the 2009 discharge procedure.

Analysis of the accounts of the accounts of the Clean Sky Joint Undertaking.

CONTENT: this Commission document sets out the consolidated annual accounts of the European Union for the financial year 2009 as prepared on the basis of the information presented by the institutions, organisations and bodies of the EU, in accordance with Article 129 (2) of the Financial Regulation applicable to the EU?s General Budget, including the European Network and Information Security Agency (ENISA).

In 2009, the tasks and budget of this agency were as follows:

- description of the Joint Undertaking?s tasks: the Clean Sky Joint Undertaking, which is located in Brussels, was established in 2007 by Regulation (EC) No 71/2008 for the period up to 31 December 2017. The objective of the Clean Sky Joint Undertaking is to accelerate the development, validation and demonstration of clean air transport technologies in the EU for earliest possible deployment;
- the Joint Undertaking?s budget for the 2009 financial year: the maximum EU contribution to the Clean Sky Joint Undertaking is EUR 800 million to be paid from the budget of the Seventh Research Framework Programme until 2017. In 2009, the EUcontributionamounted to EUR91 million in commitment appropriations.

The complete version of the Agency?s final accounts may be found at the following address:

http://www.cleansky.eu/index.php?arbo\_id=83&set\_language=en

### 2009 disharge: Clean Sky Joint Undertaking

PURPOSE: presentation by the Court of Auditors of its report on the annual accounts of the Clean Sky Joint Undertaking for the financial year 2009, together with the Agency?s replies.

CONTENT: in accordance with the tasks and objectives conferred on it by the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union (TFEU), the Court of Auditors, in the context of the discharge procedure, addresses to the European Parliament and the Council a Statement of Assurance on the reliability of the annual accounts, as well as of the legality and regularity of the transactions underlying them of each EU institution, body or agency, on the basis of an external, independent audit.

This audit also covered the annual accounts of the Clean Sky Joint Undertaking.

In the Court?s opinion, the Joint Undertaking?s annual accounts presented ?fairly, in all material respects?, its financial position as of 31 December 2009 and the results of its operations and its cash flows for the year then ended, in accordance with the provisions of its Financial Regulation.

The Court also stated that the transactions underlying the annual accounts of the Agency for the financial year ended 31 December 2009 were, ?in all material respects, legal and regular?.

The report again confirmed that the maximum EU contribution to the Clean Sky Joint Undertaking to cover running costs and research activities is EUR 800 million to be paid from the budget of the Seventh Research Framework Programme. Other Members of the Joint Undertaking are to contribute resources at least equal to the EU contribution, including in-kind contributions. In 2009, the final budget included commitment appropriations of EUR 91 million and payment appropriations of EUR 60 million.

The report also included comments on the Agency?s budgetary and financial management, together with the Agency?s replies. The main comments are as follows:

#### The Court?s comments:

- the structure and presentation of the approved budget of the Joint Undertaking for 2009 were not in line with the Council Regulation setting up the Clean Sky Joint Undertaking, nor the Financial Rules of the Joint Undertaking. The budget does not respect the principle of equilibrium and does not include all the required elements;
- weaknesses in the execution of the budget (the utilisation rate for commitment appropriations was 98 %, the rate for payment appropriations was less than 1 %; the Joint Undertaking concluded contracts for EUR 70.6 million in December 2009, but the pre-financing payments amounting to EUR 56.5 million euro could only be made in January 2010);
- deficiencies in the internal control systems (at the end of 2009, the underlying business processes had not yet been formalised and had not been validated by the Accounting Officer as required by the Financial Rules of the Joint Undertaking;
- there is no host agreement between the Clean Sky Joint Undertaking and Belgium concerning office accommodation, privileges and immunities and other support to be provided by Belgium as host State;
- the internal audit does not conform to the rules.

#### The Joint Undertaking?s replies:

- presentation of the accounts is being improved with the assistance of the Commission;
- the low implementation rate for payments in 2009 was a consequence of the start-up phase of the Joint Undertaking;
- development of internal controls and putting in place consistent and efficient methods of working which take into account the internal control standards for effective management, through a comprehensive process approach;
- the Joint Undertaking awaits the outcome of the next steps of the procedure to have an agreement signed;
- the Joint Undertaking has addressed the issue if internal audit with the Commission.

Lastly, the Court of Auditor?s report contained a summary of the Joint Undertaking?s activities in 2009 in the following areas:

- several technical achievements notably in eco-design;
- launch of 1st call for proposals;
- acquisition of final premises to house the Joint Undertaking.

## 2009 disharge: Clean Sky Joint Undertaking

The Committee on Budgetary Control adopted the report by Georgios STAVRAKAKIS (S&D, EL) on discharge to be granted to the Executive Director of the Clean Sky Joint Undertaking in respect of the implementation of the Undertaking?s budget for the financial year 2009.

Noting that the Undertaking?s annual accounts for the financial year 2009 are reliable, and the underlying transactions are legal and regular, MEPs approve the closure of the Undertaking?s accounts. However, they make a number of recommendations that need to be taken into account when the discharge is granted, in addition to the general recommendations that appear in the draft resolution on financial management and control of EU agencies (see DEC/2010/2271):

- implementation of the budget: Members note that the Joint Undertaking?s final 2009 budget included commitment appropriations of EUR 91 million and payment appropriations of EUR 60 million and that the utilisation rates for commitment and payment appropriations were 98 % and less than 1%, respectively. Although the Joint Undertaking is still in a start-up period; Members are concerned, nevertheless, that the research activities pre-financed by the Commission in 2008 on its behalf were not fully implemented during 2009 and that, as a result of delays in the projects, only EUR 8.7 million or 65% of the EUR 13.6 million pre-financing was used. Members are particularly concerned that the adoption, structure and presentation of the approved budget of the Joint Undertaking for 2009 were not in line with Regulation (EC) No 71/2008 setting up the Clean Sky Joint Undertaking, or with the Financial Rules of the Joint Undertaking. They therefore urge the Joint undertaking to rapidly remedy this grave deficiency;
- Members? contributions: Members call on the Joint Undertaking to harmonise the presentation of members' contributions in the Accounts under the guidance of the Commission;
- internal control systems: Members urge the Joint Undertaking to complete the implementation of its internal controls and financial information system. They invite it to include in its Financial Rules a specific reference to the powers of the Internal Audit Service of the Commission as its internal auditor. They consider that the role of the Commission as internal auditor should be to advise the Joint Undertaking on dealing with risks, by issuing independent opinions on the quality of management and control systems and by issuing recommendations for improving the conditions of implementation of operations and promoting sound financial management. They also consider it essential that the Joint Undertaking submit to the discharge authority a report drawn up by its director summarising the number and the type of internal audits conducted by the internal auditor. In view of the size of its budget and the complexity of its tasks, the Joint Undertaking should consider establishing an audit committee, reporting directly to the Administrative Board;
- lack of host agreement: Members urge the Joint Undertaking to rapidly conclude a host agreement with Belgium.

PURPOSE: to grant discharge to the Clean Sky Joint Undertaking in respect of the implementation of the Agency's budget for the financial year 2009.

NON-LEGISLATIVE ACT: Decision 2011/612/EU of the European Parliament on discharge in respect of the implementation of the budget of the Clean Sky Joint Undertaking for the financial year 2009.

CONTENT: with the present decision, the European Parliament grants discharge to the Executive Director of the Clean Sky Joint Undertaking for the implementation of its budget for the financial year 2009.

This decision is in line with the European Parliament's resolution adopted on 10 May 2011 and comprises a series of observations that form an integral part of the discharge decision (please refer to the summary of the opinion of 10/05/2011).

A parallel decision, adopted on the same day, approves the closure of this Agency's accounts.

## 2009 disharge: Clean Sky Joint Undertaking

The European Parliament adopted by 530 votes to 83, with 34 abstentions, a decision on discharge to be granted to the Executive Director of the Clean Sky Joint Undertaking in respect of the implementation of the Undertaking?s budget for the financial year 2009.

Noting that the Joint Undertaking?s annual accounts for the financial year 2009 are reliable, and the underlying transactions are legal and regular, Parliament approves the closure of its accounts. However, it makes a number of recommendations that need to be taken into account when the discharge is granted:

- implementation of the budget: although the Joint Undertaking is still in a start-up period; parliament is concerned that the research activities pre-financed by the Commission in 2008 on its behalf were not fully implemented during 2009 and that, as a result of delays in the projects, only EUR 8.7 million or 65% of the EUR 13.6 million pre-financing was used. It is particularly concerned that the adoption, structure and presentation of the approved budget of the Joint Undertaking for 2009 were not in line with Regulation (EC) No 71/2008 setting up the Clean Sky Joint Undertaking, or with the Financial Rules of the Joint Undertaking. It therefore urges the Joint undertaking to rapidly remedy this grave deficiency;
- Members? contributions: Parliament calls on the Joint Undertaking to harmonise the presentation of members' contributions in the Accounts under the guidance of the Commission;
- internal control systems: Parliament urges the Joint Undertaking to complete the implementation of its internal controls and financial information system. It invites it to include in its Financial Rules a specific reference to the powers of the Internal Audit Service of the Commission as its internal auditor. It considers that the role of the Commission as internal auditor should be to advise the Joint Undertaking on dealing with risks, by issuing independent opinions on the quality of management and control systems and by issuing recommendations for improving the conditions of implementation of operations and promoting sound financial management. In view of the size of its budget and the complexity of its tasks, the Joint Undertaking should consider establishing an audit committee, reporting directly to the Administrative Board;
- lack of host agreement: Parliament urges the Joint Undertaking to rapidly conclude a host agreement with Belgium.